# DROWNINGS ON THE PUBLIC RECORD OF PEOPLE ATTEMPTING TO ENTER AUSTRALIA IRREGULARLY BY BOAT SINCE 1998<sup>1</sup>

Date	Name of	Number of	Intended	Brief Description	Total Number of Deaths <sup>2</sup>			
	Vessel	Passengers	Destination		Confirmed <sup>3</sup>	Probable <sup>4</sup>	Doubtful <sup>5</sup>	Disproven <sup>6</sup>
24 Dec 1998	Paroo <sup>7</sup>	53	Mainland NT	Drowned near Coburg Peninsula in NT	1			
20 Jul 1999	Augustus <sup>8</sup>	35	Christmas Is.	Sank about 40 nm from Christmas Island	15			

#### **HOWARD TOUGHENS POLICY**

In response to an increase in irregular maritime arrivals, the Howard Government introduces Temporary Protection Visas in October 1999 placing family reunion out of reach for years for refugees who travel to Australia irregularly by boat.

15 Dec 1999	Xmas <sup>9</sup>	unknown	Mainland WA	Capsized near Cockatoo Island WA	1			
c Mar 2000	unknown <sup>10</sup>	220 est.	Christmas Is.	Claims by Howard Government that 3			220 est.	
c Mar 2000	unknown <sup>12</sup>	80 est.	Ashmore Reef	boats went missing with all presumed			80 est.	
c Mar 2000	unknown <sup>13</sup>	60 - 80	AR or CI	drowned are unsubstantiated. <sup>11</sup>			60-80	
c Dec 2000	unknown <sup>14</sup>	87 est.	Ashmore Reef	Arrived safely at Ashmore Reef				83
c Dec 2000	unknown <sup>15</sup>	80 est.	Ashmore Reef	Arrived safely at Ashmore Reef				80
21 Dec 2000	Rosalie <sup>16</sup>	63	Not stated	Drowned near La Grange Island WA	3			
	Harapan							
17 Aug 2001	Jaya II <sup>17</sup>	134	Christmas Is.	Crashed on rocks off Nusa Kembangan		2		

#### **HOWARD FURTHER TOUGHENS POLICY**

Following the MV Tampa Incident in late August 2001, the Howard Government introduces a suite of measures to 'deter and deny' irregular boat arrivals, including excising territory from the Australian migration zone, offshore processing at Nauru & Manus Island & 'Operation Relex' – an intensified surveillance patrol & response by the ADF in international waters between Indonesia & the Australian territories of Christmas Island & Ashmore Reef involving naval vessels & P3 Orion aircraft.

19 Oct 2001	SIEVX <sup>18</sup>	420 est.	Christmas Is.	45 Rescued at 07 40 00S / 105 09 00E	353 <sup>19</sup>		
29 Oct 2001	SIEV 7 <sup>20</sup>	215	Indonesia	Tow back – left 300m from Roti Island		3	
08 Nov 2001	SIEV 10 <sup>21</sup>	160	Ashmore Reef	Engine fire near Ashmore Reef	2		

#### **RUDD SOFTENS POLICY**

In November 2007, after nearly 12 years in Opposition the Australian Labor Party led by Kevin Rudd defeats the Howard LNP coalition. The New Government introduces a range of Immigration reforms, including closing offshore processing centres at Nauru & Manus Island (Feb 2008) and abolishing Temporary Protection Visas (Aug 2008).

c 14 Jan 2009	unknown <sup>22</sup>	18	Ashmore Reef	Capsized in Rote Strait off Kupang	9		
16 Apr 2009	SIEV 36 <sup>23</sup>	47	Ashmore Reef	Explosion on vessel near Ashmore	5		
03 Oct 2009	unknown <sup>24</sup>	105 est.	Christmas Is.	Missing at sea - all presumed drowned		105 est.	
01 Nov 2009	SIEV 69 <sup>25</sup>	39	Cocos Island	Capsized 350nm NW off Cocos Island	12		
09 May 2010	SIEV 143 <sup>26</sup>	64	Cocos Island	5 left stricken vessel by raft to seek help	5		
c 14 Jun 2010	unknown <sup>27</sup>	unknown	AR or CI	Up to 12 drowned transferring boats		2-12	

Date	Name of	Number of	Intended	Brief Description	Total Number of Deaths <sup>2</sup>					
	Vessel	Passengers	Destination		Confirmed <sup>3</sup>	Probable⁴	Doubtful <sup>5</sup>	Disproven <sup>6</sup>		
GILLARD TOUGHENS POLICY  Julia Gillard becomes Prime Minister on 24 June 2010 and announces a toughening of Immigration policy in regard to irregular boat arrivals. 28										
c 13 Nov 2010	unknown <sup>29</sup>	97 est.	Christmas Is.	Missing at sea - all presumed drowned		97 est.				
15 Dec 2010	SIEV 221 <sup>30</sup>	90 est.	Christmas Is.	Crashed on rocks at Christmas Island	50			_		

#### GILLARD ADOPTS ANTI-DROWNING RATIONALE

On 25 July 2011 Malaysia and Australia sign an agreement where 800 irregular boat arrivals will be sent to Malaysia and 4000 refugees will be resettled in Australia from Malaysia over 4 years. A month later, on 31 August, the High Court finds this arrangement to be invalid and the gov't is forced to abandon it before implementation. Soon after, the gov't recasts the debate on the increased numbers of irregular boat arrivals in terms of humanitarian concern about the death rate of asylum seekers on these boats.

01 Nov 2011	unknown <sup>31</sup>	75 est.	Christmas Is.	Foundered 5nm off S Java/Pangandaran	8	19 est.	
17 Dec 2011	Barokah <sup>32</sup>	250 est.	Christmas Is.	Capsized near Prigi, 40 NM off coast	103	98 est.	
01 Feb 2012	unknown <sup>33</sup>	25 est.	Aus via Batam	Sunk off the coast of Malaysia	11		
22 May 2012	unknown <sup>34</sup>	25 est.	Christmas Is.	Missing at sea - all presumed drowned		25 est.	
21 Jun 2012	SIEV 358 <sup>35</sup>	214 est.	Christmas Is.	Capsized 110 NM N of Christmas Island	17	85 est.	
27 Jun 2012	SIEV 359 <sup>36</sup>	134 est.	Christmas Is.	Capsized 100 NM N of Christmas Island	1	3 est.	
29 Jun 2012	unknown <sup>37</sup>	67 est.	Christmas Is.	Missing at sea – all presumed drowned		67 est.	
12 Aug 2012	unknown <sup>38</sup>	24 est.	Christmas Is.	Missing at sea - all presumed drowned		24 est.	

#### GILLARD FURTHER TOUGHENS POLICY

Following recommendations in the 'Report of the Expert Panel on Asylum Seekers', <sup>39</sup>
the Gillard Government legislates to resume offshore processing of irregular boat arrivals. From 13 August 2013
any asylum seeker arriving irregularly by boat may, at the discretion of the government, be transferred to Nauru or Manus Island for processing.

30 Aug 2012	unknown <sup>40</sup>	150 est.	Christmas Is.	Rescued about 40nm from Java coast	1	94 est.	
26 Oct 2012	unknown <sup>41</sup>	34	Christmas Is.	Sank about 1/3 of the way to Christmas		33	
c25 Jan 2013	SIEV 580 <sup>42</sup>	19 est.	Christmas Is.	Tried to raft 20 nm to Christmas for help		3	
28 Jan 2013	unknown <sup>43</sup>	25	Christmas Is.	Smashed on rocks off coast of Java	2	1	
25 Mar 2013	SIEV 624 <sup>44</sup>	96	Christmas Is.	Capsized 14NM N of Christmas Island	2		
10 Apr 2013	unknown <sup>45</sup>	72	Christmas Is.	Sank in Sunda Strait	5	53	
c05 May 2013	unknown <sup>46</sup>	48	Christmas Is.	Set off on makeshift raft seeking help		2	
C24 May 2013	unknown <sup>47</sup>	unknown	Christmas Is.	28 Life jackets washed up on Cocos Is.		28 est.	
5-7 Jun 2013	unknown <sup>48</sup>	60 est.	Christmas Is.	Capsized hull found at 9-57S, 104-34E	13	47 est.	
c09 Jun 2013	Jayawe <sup>49</sup>	34 est.	Cocos Is.	Missing at sea – all presumed drowned		34 est.	
16 Jun 2013	SIEV 749 <sup>50</sup>	79	unknown	Swept overboard – presumed drowned		1	

Page 2 of 12

Date	Name of	Number of	Intended	Brief Description	Total Number of Deaths <sup>2</sup>			
	Vessel	Passengers	Destination		Confirmed <sup>3</sup>	Probable <sup>4</sup>	Doubtful <sup>5</sup>	Disproven <sup>6</sup>

#### RUDD FURTHER TOUGHENS POLICY

Kevin Rudd becomes Prime Minister for the second time on 26 June 2013.

On 19 July 2013 the Prime Minister announces that henceforth 'any asylum seeker who arrives in Australia by boat will have no chance of being resettled in Australia as [a] refugee' and that all irregular maritime arrivals will be sent to Manus Island and elsewhere in Papua New Guinea for assessment of their refugee claims; two days later the Minister for Home Affairs, Jason Clare, announces that the Australian Federal Police will pay rewards of up to \$200,000 for information leading to the arrest and conviction of Australian based people smugglers; 'prosecutions can be against organisers of people smuggling ventures into Australia. or people providing support and assistance to them'. 51

13 Jul 2013	SIEV 784 <sup>52</sup>	97	Christmas Is.	Dead in the water & capsized	1	8	
16 Jul 2013	SIEV 794 <sup>53</sup>	150 est.	Christmas Is.	Capsized while escorted by 2 frigates	4	11	
23 Jul 2013	unknown <sup>54</sup>	209 est.	Christmas Is.	Foundered off the coast of Java	20		
20 Aug 2013	unknown <sup>55</sup>	111 est.	Christmas Is.	Foundered 120NM north of Christmas Is.		5	

#### ABBOTT FURTHER TOUGHENS POLICY

Tony Abbott is elected Prime Minister of Australia on 7 September 2013.

The Coalition government was elected on a platform of establishing a military led response to people smuggling similar to John Howard's Operation Relex in 2001.

Operation Sovereign Borders (OSB) commenced on 18 September, commanded by Lieutenant General Angus Campbell, reporting directly to the Minister for Immigration, Scott Morrison. 56

27 Sep 2013	unknown <sup>57</sup>	81 est.	Christmas Is.	Foundered about 50 metres from Java	43 <sup>58</sup>	10 est.			
9 Dec 2013	unknown <sup>59</sup>	32 est.	Christmas Is.	Foundered 75NM west of Cilacap	2	1			
SUB-TOTAL					689	861- 871 est.	<b>360 - 380</b> est.	163	
TOTAL					1550-1560 confirmed + probable drownings				

# Compiled by Marg Hutton, sievx.com

© Marg Hutton ~ originally compiled: 30 September 2011; Last updated: 2 February 2014

Permanent URL: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/DrowningsTable.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/background/DrowningsTable.pdf</a> ; Please submit additional information or corrections via sievx.com website. For figures regarding annual death rate by drowning on irregular boat voyages to Australia see: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/Mortality.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/background/Mortality.pdf</a>

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 3 of 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Please note this table does not include the 98 Myanmar nationals who died of dehydration and whose bodies were jettisoned after their boat had been at sea for two months. 32 survivors of this voyage were rescued about 250NM off the coast of Sri Lankan by the Sri Lankan Navy on 16 February 2013. See Sirilal & Aneez, 'Myanmar migrant survivors tell of throwing dead overboard', Reuters, 18 February 2013; online at: <a href="http://in.reuters.com/article/2013/02/18/srilanka-myanmar-detention-idlNDEE91H0E820130218">http://in.reuters.com/article/2013/02/18/srilanka-myanmar-detention-idlNDEE91H0E820130218</a>; copy on line at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130218Reuters.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130218Reuters.html</a>

Also not included in this table are the deaths on two boats that sank in late April 2009 and late May 2009 – the first boat sank off the coast of Malaysia and the second sank in the Malacca Strait near the island of Halang. There is no evidence that these boats were directly en route to Australia or, in the case of the first boat, that the passengers were asylum seekers. See the following news articles:

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Malaysian Police: No Proof Drowned Pakistanis Enroute To Australia', Nam News Network, 1 May 2009;

Nelson Benjamin, Meera Vijayan and Austin Camoens, 'Two children, seven adults drown in boat tragedy', Star Online, 29 April 2009; online at: http://thestar.com.my/news/story.asp?file=/2009/4/29/nation/3795930&sec=nation

<sup>&#</sup>x27;6 Afghans Dead, 14 Missing After Boat Capsizes', Jakarta Globe, 29 May 2009; online at:

http://www.thejakartaglobe.com/indonesia/6-afghans-dead-14-missing-after-boat-capsizes/277952

'Bodies of Afghan migrants to be buried in Rohil', Jakarta Post, 29 May 2009; online at:

http://www.thejakartapost.com/node/212993

See Answers to Question on Notice nos. 83 and 84 asked by Senator Ronaldson to Australian Customs and Border Protection Service at Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs, 26 May 2011; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf">http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf</a>

<sup>2</sup> The most accurate estimate of the total number of asylum seekers who have drowned at sea en route to Australia is obtained by adding the totals in the confirmed and probable columns. The doubtful and disproven columns listed in the table are there to indicate which incidents should not be included in the count.

<sup>3</sup> For the purposes of this table deaths are considered 'confirmed' when there is an official Australian Government record acknowledging the drownings or multiple Indonesian media reports of an official Indonesian search and rescue operation.

<sup>4</sup> For the purposes of this table deaths are considered 'probable' when there is an official Australian Government record of receipt of a notice of a possible vessel in distress of sufficient credibility to act; or mainstream media reports of eyewitness accounts of people missing from a boat that foundered; or multiple media reports of people contacting media or government about missing relatives or friends who had informed them they were embarking on a specific people smuggling journey which is believed to have foundered.

<sup>5</sup> For the purposes of this table deaths are considered 'doubtful' when there are mainstream Australian media reports of drownings based primarily on information from the Minister for Immigration but an absence of media reports of people contacting media or government about missing relatives or friends who had informed them they were embarking on a specific people smuggling journey.

<sup>6</sup> For the purposes of this table deaths are considered 'disproven' when mainstream Australian media reports of drownings based on information from the Minister for Immigration are later invalidated by Australian Government official record of safe arrival.

<sup>7</sup> Answers to Questions taken on notice by DIMA from Committee Hearing on 30 January 2001 - 'Joint Committee Of Public Accounts And Audit - Inquiry Into Coastwatch' - and provided to the Senate in March 2001 - p.6. Copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf</a>; see also Philip Ruddock, 'Drowning tragedy highlights hazards of people smuggling', DIMA Media Release, 22 July 1989 copy from Parliamentary database online at <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/19990722RuddockMediarelease.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/19990722RuddockMediarelease.pdf</a>

8 Ibid;

<sup>9</sup> Answers to Questions taken on notice by DIMA from Committee Hearing on 30 January 2001 - 'Joint Committee Of Public Accounts And Audit - Inquiry Into Coastwatch' - and provided to the Senate in March 2001 - p.6. Copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf</a>

10 For numbers on board this alleged boat see: Tony Wright, '220 boat people feared drowned', *Age*, 12 April 2000; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/20000412\_Age.html">http://sievx.com/articles/background/20000412\_Age.html</a>; see also 'More than 250 boat people believed drowned', DIMA Media release, 13 April 2000, copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000413DIMAMediaRelease.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000413DIMAMediaRelease.html</a>, Brendan Nicholson, 'Hundreds die tied up to hulks', *Sunday Age*, 27 July 2000, copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html</a> and Andrew Clennell, 'Hope fades for missing boat people', *SMH*, 13 April 2000; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/20000413\_SMH.html">http://sievx.com/articles/background/20000413\_SMH.html</a>; there is significant doubt that this boat went missing - see Appendix - 'Howard government claims that three asylum seeker boats went missing in March 2000 with all on board presumed drowned are unsubstantiated'.

<sup>11</sup> For the rationale as to why the numbers aboard these three allegedly missing boats should not be included in a confirmed or probable count of asylum seekers drowned at sea see Appendix - 'Howard government claims that three asylum seeker boats went missing in March 2000 with all on board presumed drowned are unsubstantiated' 'A second boat, thought to have been carrying about 80 people, also vanished with all aboard after sailing from Kupang, in West Timor.' – Brendan Nicholson, 'Hundreds die tied up to hulks', *Sunday Age*, 27 July 2000, copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html</a>; there is significant doubt that this boat went missing - see Appendix - 'Howard government claims that three asylum seeker boats went missing in March 2000 with all on board presumed drowned are unsubstantiated'.

<sup>13</sup> 'Another [boat] left Java about the same time with 60 to 80 aboard. It sank, but some of those aboard may have been rescued. "You can imagine that you'd get 70 or 100 nautical miles out, the motor breaks down in bad weather, the vessel broaches and disappears under a wave - it could all happen very, very quickly," an official said.' – Brendan Nicholson, 'Hundreds die tied up to hulks', *Sunday Age*, 27 July 2000, copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20000723\_Age.html</a>; there is significant doubt that this boat went missing - see Appendix - 'Howard government claims that 3 asylum seeker boats went missing in March 2000 with all on board presumed drowned are unsubstantiated'.

<sup>14</sup> 'It has now been ascertained from interviews concluded this week with recent boat arrivals that all missing and overdue vessels have now arrived safely... All reports from the Australian community of missing persons were followed through, with names then checked off against the nominal rolls of incoming boats, until all names were

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 4 of 12

accounted for.' See Amanda Vanstone, Answer to Question on Notice no.3241, 'Refugees Boat Sinkings', Senate Hansard, 6 February 2001, pp.21436-7; online at: <a href="http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansards/2001-02-06/toc\_pdf/939-268.pdf">http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansards/2001-02-06/toc\_pdf/939-268.pdf</a> Copy of extract online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf</a>

See also:

'Boats Feared Missing Accounted for in Christmas Influx', DIMA Media Release, 3 January 2001, copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/background/20010103DIMAMediaRelease.html

Andrew Clennell, 'Minister's reports of 500 deaths premature', SMH, 18 December 2000; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/background/20001218MinistersReportsPremature.html

For earlier articles and press releases citing this boat and another as missing or lost, see for example:

'Up to 163 Boatpeople Feared Drowned En Route to Australia', DIMA Media Release, 13 December 2000; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/background/20001213DIMAMediaRelease.html

Michael Vincent, 'Ruddock defends inaction on refugees lost at sea', The World Today, 14 December 2000; copy of transcript online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/background/20001214WorldToday.html

Andrew Clennell, 'Not our job: no search as 160 boat people lost at sea', SMH, 14 December 2000; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/background/20001214NotOurJob.html

15 Ibid.

Answers to Questions taken on notice by DIMA from Committee Hearing on 30 January 2001 - 'Joint Committee Of Public Accounts And Audit - Inquiry Into Coastwatch' - and provided to the Senate in March 2001 - p.6. Copy available online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/200103xxDIMA-ToCoastwatchInquiry.pdf</a>
See also:

Amanda Vanstone, Answer to Question on Notice no.3241, 'Refugees Boat Sinkings', Senate Hansard, 6 February 2001, pp.21436-7 online at: <a href="http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansards/2001-02-06/toc\_pdf/939-268.pdf">http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansards/2001-02-06/toc\_pdf/939-268.pdf</a> Copy of extract online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf</a>

'Possible drownings highlight dangers of illegal travel', DIMA Media Release, 22 December 2000 copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/background/20001222DIMAMediaRelease.html

<sup>17</sup> "When water started to fill the hull, the asylum seekers tried to bail with their hands. Said Sakhi, 20, fell into the sea as waves washed over them. 'For God's sake help me,' he screamed before slipping away and drowning. Fatima, 20, clutched her baby, Murtaza Roni, who had been born in Indonesia two-and-a-half months earlier. But as the boat split into pieces she lost her grip and the baby fell into the water. 'We could see him. But nobody could reach him,' says Abdul Rashid Matin. 'The rest of us managed to get ashore and then we found the body." ~ Lindsay Murdoch, Shipwrecked in Indonesia, *Age*, 6 September 2001, copy online at:

http://www.sievx.com/articles/psdp/20010906Murdoch.html . According to Murdoch, the sinking took place three weeks earlier. From other media reports the date was able to be precisely determined. See Sophie Douez, 'Three dead as refugee boat runs aground ', Age, 20 August 2001; copy online at:

http://www.sievx.com/articles/psdp/20010820SophieDouez.html and 'Two killed as boat carrying Afghans sinks', *Jakarta Post*, 20 August 2001; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/psdp/20010820JakartaPost.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/psdp/20010820JakartaPost.html</a> (Although these earlier accounts vary in detail from the later Murdoch article it is apparent that they are all referring to the same incident. Murdoch's account is likely to be more accurate as it is three weeks after the event and is based on interviews with survivors of the sinking.)

<sup>18</sup> Senate Select Committee on A Certain Maritime Incident, 2002; online at:

http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary Business/Committees/Senate Committees?url=maritime incident ctte/index.htm

A comprehensive archives of documents on the SIEVX sinking is available online at: <a href="http://sievx.com">http://sievx.com</a>; See in particular:

http://sievx.com/articles/disaster/

http://sievx.com/chronology/

http://sievx.com/FAQ.shtml

To date, there is still no exact figure for the number of people who lost their lives on SIEVX. The generally accepted number is 353 - 146 children, 142 women and 65 men, but this is only an estimate. There is no evidence of an official Indonesian Search and Rescue response to this disaster and as far as can be determined, there were only ever two bodies recovered. However, over the last decade, the Australian government has issued many documents that cite the number '353' as the SIEVX death toll.

David Marr & Marian Wilkinson, *Dark Victory*, 2nd edition, Allen & Unwin, 2004, p.328; 'To Deter and Deny', *Four Corners*, 15 April 2002; copy of transcript online at: http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/20020415FourCorners.html

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 5 of 12

http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansards/2006-11-27/toc\_pdf/5146-3.pdf;fileType=application%2Fpdf; copy of extract online at: http://sievx.com/testimony/2006/20061127EllisonToMilneQoN1411.html; See also David Marr & Marian Wilkinson, *Dark Victory*, op.cit., pp.350-364

<sup>22</sup> Yemris Fointuna, 'Search for five missing aliens hindered by bad weather', *Jakarta Post*, 17 January 2009; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/2009/20090117YemrisFointuna.html

Yemris Fointuna, 'Police hunt people smugglers', *Jakarta Post*, 19 January 2009; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/2009/20090119YemrisFointuna.html">http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/2009/20090119YemrisFointuna.html</a> Adam Gartrell, 'People smuggler deserves jail: court ',AAP, 1 September 2009; online at

http://tinyurl.com/5soz7d8; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/psdp/2009/20090901AdamGartrell.html

Note: Australian government does not confirm these deaths. See Answer to Question on Notice, no.82, Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs, Australian Customs and Border Protection Service, asked on 26 May 2011; online at: http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf

<sup>23</sup> Inquest into the death of Mohammed Hassan Ayubi, Muzafar Ali Sefarali, Mohammed Amen Zamen, Awar Nadar, Baquer Husani [2010] NTMC 014; online at: <a href="http://www.nt.gov.au/justice/courtsupp/coroner/documents/D0061-D0063D0118-D0119Ashmore.pdf">http://www.nt.gov.au/justice/courtsupp/coroner/documents/D0061-D0063D0118-D0119Ashmore.pdf</a>; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100317InquestFinding.pdf

For government response, see Sarah Hanson-Young's questions to Australian Customs and Border Protection Service in Senate Budget Estimates, Legal and Constitutional Affairs Legislation Committee Hansard, 25 May 2010, pp.42-45; online at:

http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary Business/Committees/Senate Committees?url=@Hansard/S13014.pdf

See also Answer to Question on Notice no. 86 asked by Senator Ronaldson to Australian Customs and Border Protection Service at Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs, 26 May 2011; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf

In a speech to Parliament, Dr Andrew Leigh also referred to this missing boat. See House Hansard, 22 September 2011, pp.11185-88; online at:

http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/download/chamber/hansardr/5b012e56-8181-4d47-8693-

e886483f9ac1/toc pdf/House%20of%20Representatives 2011 09 22 436 Official.pdf;

There have been many newspaper articles that cite the concerns of relatives and friends of passengers on this missing boat. See for example:

'Hazaras boat bound for Australia missing', AAP, 17 January 2010; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100117AAP.html

Nicola Berkovic and Brendan Nicholson, 'Children feared to be on missing boat', Australian, 19 January 2010; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100119BerkovicNicholson.html

Tom Allard and Yuko Narushima, 'Governments knew asylum boat was in danger', SMH, 25 May 2010; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100525TomAllard.html

Natalie O'Brien, 'Pressure mounts over ghost boats', Brisbane Times, 11 September 2011; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110911NatalieOBrien.html

Natalie O'Brien, 'Customs under pressure over missing boat', SMH, 18 September 2011; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110918NatalieOBrien.html

Alastair Hope, 'Record of Investigation into death of Tharmeswaran Thambiaiya' (SIEV 69 Coronial Report), December 2012, copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/201212xxSIEV69CoronialReport.pdf">http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/201212xxSIEV69CoronialReport.pdf</a> ; see also Debbie Guest, 'Refugee tragedy at sea "was needless", *Australian*, 15 September 2012, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/refugee-tragedy-at-sea-was-needless/story-fn59niix-1226474534574">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/rescue-skipper-went-fishing/story-fn9hm1gu-1226666529442</a> ; copy online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/rescue-skipper-went-fishing/story-fn9hm1gu-1226666529442">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/rescue-skipper-went-fishing/story-fn9hm1gu-1226666529442</a> ; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130620JoelMagarey.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130620JoelMagarey.html</a>

<sup>26</sup> Minister for Home Affairs, 'Maritime Search And Rescue Operation Near Cocos Islands – Update', Media Release, 8 May 2010; copy online at <a href="http://tinyurl.com/7s7jb22">http://tinyurl.com/7s7jb22</a>
Minister for Home Affairs, 'Maritime Search And Rescue Operation Complete', Media Release, 9 May 2010; online at: <a href="http://tinyurl.com/7cp67or">http://tinyurl.com/7cp67or</a>
See also Answer to Question on Notice no. 88 asked by Senator Ronaldson to Australian Customs and Border Protection Service at Senate Standing Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs, 26 May 2011; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf">http://sievx.com/testimony/2011/Ronaldson.pdf</a>

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 6 of 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Senator Chris Ellison, Answer to Question on Notice, no.1411, 'Illegal Entry Vessels', 27 November 2006, p.136 online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20101226NatalieOBrien.html

Natalie O'Brien, 'Lost for 42 days, another tragedy on the horizon', *Brisbane Times*, 26 December 2010; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20101226NatalieOBrien2.html Note that appended to this article online is an AAP report quoting refugee advocate Jack Smit who believed at the time that this boat had arrived safely. However, see: Natalie O'Brien, 'Lost and Forsaken', *Sun Herald* ('Extra' section), 8 May 2011, pp. 1,3; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110508NatalieOBrienSunHeraldExtra.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110508NatalieOBrien.html</a> (This article includes photos of 34 of the alleged passengers on this boat provided to O'Brien by friends and family of the missing); Natalie O'Brien, 'Suspect linked to lost boat', *SMH*, 15 May 2011; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110515NatalieOBrien.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110515NatalieOBrien.html</a>

There were 30 bodies recovered and 20 people missing presumed from the sinking of SIEV 221. The Western Australian Coroner, Alastair Hope, determined that the deaths of the missing 20 people had been established beyond reasonable doubt. Hope's report includes a full list of the names of the fifty people who lost their lives in this incident. See A N Hope, State Coroner, 'Inquest into the deaths of SIEV 221 Christmas Island', Western Australian Coroner's Court, 23 February 2012, online at: <a href="http://www.coronerscourt.wa.gov.au/">http://www.coronerscourt.wa.gov.au/</a> files/Christmas Island Findings.pdf; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/SIEV221/20120212CoronersFindings.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/SIEV221/20120212CoronersFindings.pdf</a>; See also: Report of Joint Select Committee on the Christmas Island Tragedy of 15 December 2010, Commonwealth of Australia, June 2011, p.vii; online at: <a href="http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary">http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary</a> Business/Committees/Senate Committees?url=christmas island ctte/christmas island/report/index.htm

<sup>31</sup> 6 bodies have been recovered and another twenty people are missing feared drowned. Forty-six people have been rescued. Minister for Home Affairs, Brendan O'Connor, 'Topics: Vessel sunk in Indonesian waters, boat arrival', Doorstop, Parliament House, Canberra, 1 November 2011; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20111101BrendanOConnor.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20111101BrendanOConnor.html</a>; see also Maritime Operations and Incidents', 15 October 2012, FOI Document no.2 released by Australian Customs & Border Protection Service, 13 February 2013, (p.66) online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf">http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216\_KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf</a>

'48 people were rescued, including 3 Indonesian crew, with the number of deceased at 8. The remainder are unaccounted for, however up to 75 people may have been on board the vessel when it foundered.' Anthony Seebach (National Manager, Border Strategies and Priorities Branch, Australian Customs and Border Protection Service) to Marg Hutton, 1 February 2012; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120201AnthonySeebachtoMargHutton.jpg

<sup>32</sup> 'Regarding the 17 December sinking off Prigi Beach, Java, the latest information is that 49 people, including 2 Indonesian crew, were rescued and the number of deceased sadly stands at 103. The Indonesian maritime search and rescue agency BASARNAS has reported that around 250 people were on board the vessel but this figure and the total number of missing people remains unconfirmed.' 'Anthony Seebach (National Manager, Border Strategies and Priorities Branch, Australian Customs and Border Protection Service) to Marg Hutton, 1 February 2012; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120201AnthonySeebachtoMargHutton.jpg; see also 'Maritime Operations and Incidents', 15 October 2012, FOI Document no.2 released by Australian Customs & Border Protection Service, 13 February 2013, (p.65) online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf">http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216\_KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf">http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216\_KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf</a>

'Surabaya Basarnas head Sutrisno told *The Jakarta Post* on Monday that the 10-day search effort, involving members of the Navy, Air Force and the National Police, located 101 dead victims and 49 survivors...East Java Police Medical And Health Affairs head Sr. Comr. Didi Agus Mintadi...rectified the number of bodies received by the Bhayangkara Hospital from 85 to 84 bodies, saying that one body bag initially counted contained the limbs of another person. The number of bodies taken to the Sanglah General Hospital in Denpasar, Bali, was 19, thus bringing the total number of bodies found to 103 from the accident. The data is different to that of the Surabaya Basarnas, which recorded 101.' Wahyoe Boediwardhana and Indra Harsaputra, 'Search for missing boat passengers ends', *Jakarta Post*, 27 December 2011, online at: http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2011/12/27/search-missing-boat-passengers-ends.html copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/Barokah/20111227JakartaPost.html

See also: Natalie O'Brien, 'Lives lost after rescue plea denied', Canberra Times, 8 July 2012; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120708NatalieOBrien.html

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 7 of 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> See Question without Notice, Senate Hansard, 'Asylum Seekers' 17 June 2010, pp.3651-2; online at:

http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parllnfo/download/chamber/hansards/2010-06-17/toc\_pdf/7713-3.pdf; Stephen Fitzpatrick, 'Merak passengers among 12 boatpeople drowned', Australian, 14 June 2010; online at: <a href="http://tinyurl.com/6cmdwrn">http://tinyurl.com/6cmdwrn</a>; Stephen Fitzpatrick, 'Border protection seeks confirmation of boatpeople deaths', Australian, 14 June 2010, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/border-protection-seeks-confirmation-of-boatpeople-deaths/story-e6frg6n6-1225879546863">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/border-protection-seeks-confirmation-of-boatpeople-deaths/story-e6frg6n6-1225879546863</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100614StephenFitzpatrick.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100614StephenFitzpatrick.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> See Julia Gillard's speech to the Lowy Institute on 6 July 2010, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100706JuliaGillard.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2010/20100706JuliaGillard.html</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Natalie O'Brien, 'Relatives fear 97 refugees have died at sea', *Age*, 26 December 2010; copy online at:

Minister for Home Affairs, Jason Clare, has indicated that Australia received a distress call from Barokah – 'We received calls from a vessel in distress last year in December that was very close to the Indonesian shoreline. You might remember that vessel in December just off the coast of Indonesia where two hundred people drowned...' see: Jason Clare & Tony Negus, Joint Press Conference, 5 July 2012, online at:

http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Third%20Quarter/5-July-2012-Joint-Press-Conference-with-Tony-Negus-and-Simon-Corbell.aspx; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120705ClareNegusPresser.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120705ClareNegusPresser.html</a>; for more on this incident see: Marg Hutton 'Barokah', sievx.com, online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/Barokah/index.shtml">http://www.sievx.com/articles/Barokah/index.shtml</a>

<sup>33</sup> 'Rescue efforts and investigations into the incident were undertaken by the Royal Malaysian Police (RMP) in Johor State with assistance from the Malaysian Maritime Enforcement Agency (MMEA). According to Malaysian authorities, the vessel was believed to be carrying around 29 passengers. 18 were rescued (12 Afghans, 1 Pakistani and 5 Iraqis) - 11 are confirmed deceased (nationalities to be determined)' - in 'A request for seven documents relating to a capsized vessel at Prigi Beach', Australian Customs & Border Protection Service, FOI 2012/008006, Documents Released 29 June 2012, p.25 of 104, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/Barokah/2012-008006">http://sievx.com/articles/Barokah/2012-008006</a> Documents Released.pdf . See also: Jason Clare, Minister for Home Affairs, interviewed by Frank Kelly, *Radio National*, 22 June 2012 online at <a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Second%20Quarter/22-June-2012---Interview-with-Fran-Kelly---ABC-Radio-National.aspx">http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Second%20Quarter/22-June-2012---Interview-with-Fran-Kelly---ABC-Radio-National.aspx</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120622JasonClareFranKelly.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120622JasonClareFranKelly.html</a>; and Mex Cooper, 'Asylum seekers drown on way to Australia', *SMH*, 2 February, 2012, copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120202MexCooper.html

<sup>34</sup> "The Ghost Boat" | Asylum Seeker Boat missing from eight months', Hazara Asylum Seekers Website, 18 December 2012; online at: http://hazaraasylumseekers.wordpress.com/2012/12/18/the-ghost-boat-asylum-seeker-boat-missing-since-may-2012/; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/22May2012/20121218Hazara.html;

'Australian government agencies have insufficient information to determine conclusively whether or not this voyage took place' – 'Maritime Operations & Incidents', Australian Customs & Border Protection Service, 15 October 2012, p.73; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216\_KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf">http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216\_KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf</a> (extracted from <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf">http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf</a> listed on the Australian Customs & Border Protection FOI Log - <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/disclosurelog/default.asp">http://www.customs.gov.au/disclosurelog/default.asp</a>)

Note: I currently have a Freedom of Information request with Australian Customs & Border Protection Service seeking access to any documents or reports or emails about this boat in the hopes that more information has become available since October 2012.

<sup>35</sup> 'In total 17 bodies were recovered. 85 people were not recovered and are presumed drowned.', Marco Tedeschi, Counsel Assisting the Coroner, Opening Remarks in Inquest into SIEV 358 deaths, 25 June 2013 copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/Kaniva/20130625OpeningByCounselAssistingTheCoroner.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/Kaniva/20130625OpeningByCounselAssistingTheCoroner.html</a>
'As question time was coming to an end last Thursday a Border Protection Command Dash 8 aircraft spotted a capsized boat with approximately 40 people crowded on its hull 110 nautical miles north of Christmas Island. This triggered a massive search and rescue effort involving Navy patrol boats, surveillance aircraft and merchant ships. By late that night 110 people had been plucked from the sea. The search and rescue effort continued into the night, into the next day and the day after that. Unfortunately, no more people were found alive. The search for survivors was suspended at 8.44 pm Saturday night Australian Eastern Standard Time. There were, reportedly, 200 people on board this vessel. We may never know for certain but it is likely that approximately 90 people may have lost their lives. The bodies of 17 people have been recovered.' Jason Clare, Minister for Home Affairs, Answer to Question on Notice, 25 June 2012, transcript online at:

http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Second%20Quarter/25-June-2012---Question-without-Notice.aspx; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/Kaniva/20120625QoN.html">http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/Kaniva/20120625QoN.html</a> (Firmer figures on the death count from this incident will become available when the West Australian Coroner publishes his findings later this year and this table will be updated accordingly.)

Note: SIEV 358 is also known by the code name 'Kaniva' and the AMSA incident reference no. AUSSAR 2012/4106; for more on this incident see: Marg Hutton, 'SIEV 358 – "Kaniva", sievx.com, online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/358-Kaniva.shtml

<sup>36</sup> 'One-hundred-and-thirty people were saved. Unfortunately, we recovered one body. The latest information is that there were one-hundred-and-thirty-four people on board. That means that four people perished in the disaster yesterday.' Jason Clare, Minister for Home Affairs, interviewed by Adam Spencer, 702 ABC Sydney, 28 June 2012; online at: <a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Second%20Quarter/28-June-2012---Interview-with-Adam-Spencer---702-ABC-Sydney.aspx">http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Second%20Quarter/28-June-2012---Interview-with-Adam-Spencer---702-ABC-Sydney.aspx</a>; for background to this sinking see: Paul Maley, 'Rescuers save women and children after their asylum boat capsized', *Australian*, 27 June 2012; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120627PaulMaley.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120627PaulMaley.html</a>

Note: SIEV 359 is also known by the code name 'Marama' and the AMSA incident reference no. AUSSAR 2012/4259.

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 8 of 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> 'Given the number of enquiries received from a range of sources, and time that has passed with no word from those believed to have travelled on this vessel, we can only assume that the vessel's passengers have been lost at sea' - FOI - Document No. 2 'Maritime Operations and Incidents', p.72 in Australian Customs & Border

Protection Service ~ 2012/047216, online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf">http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-047216\_DocumentsReleased.pdf</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216">http://www.sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/2013/2012-047216</a> KEYISSUE1-FO1Doc2.pdf; See also:

'A request for access to any documents or reports or emails about an asylum seeker boat believed to have gone missing while on its way to Australia from Indonesia on 30 June 2012', FOI - Australian Customs & Border Protection Service - 2012/028963, Notice of decision online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_NoticeOfDecision.pdf">http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_NoticeOfDecision.pdf</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents-1-46\_Released.pdf">http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents-1-46\_Released.pdf</a>; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/PalestinianLostBoat/2012-028963\_Documents-1-46\_Released.pdf; Documents 47-71 online at:

 $\underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ online \ at: \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_47-71\_Released.pdf} \ ; \ copy \ \underline{http://www.customs.gov.au/webdata/resources/files/2012-028963\_Documents\_4$ 

http://sievx.com/articles/FOI/Customs/PalestinianLostBoat/2012-028963 Documents 47-71 Released.pdf; see also: Kate Bastians, 'Fears for loved ones lost in ocean crossing', West Australian, 11 August 2012, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120811KateBastians.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120811KateBastians.html</a>; Kate Bastians, 'Heat put on response to distress calls', West Australian, 14 August 2012, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120814KateBastians.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120814KateBastians.html</a>; Natalie O'Brien, 'Palestinian envoy raised alarm about missing asylum boat', SMH, 16 August 2012, online at: <a href="http://www.smh.com.au/opinion/political-news/palestinian-envoy-raised-alarm-about-missing-asylum-boat-20120815-2495j.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120816NatalieOBrien.html</a>

<sup>38</sup> See 'Another missing asylum seeker boat', Hazara Asylum seekers website, 22 October 2012; online at: http://hazaraasylumseekers.wordpress.com/2012/10/22/another-missing-asylum-seeker-boat/; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/12August2012/20121022Hazara.html . Note: I currently have a Freedom of Information request with Australian Customs & Border Protection Service seeking access to any documents or reports or emails about this boat.

<sup>39</sup> Report of the Expert Panel on Asylum Seekers, August 2012, online at: <a href="http://expertpanelonasylumseekers.dpmc.gov.au/report">http://expertpanelonasylumseekers.dpmc.gov.au/report</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://expertpanelonasylumseekers.dpmc.gov.au/report">http://expertpanelonasylumseekers.dpmc.gov.au/report</a>; panel on asylum seekers full report.pdf

<sup>40</sup> Jason Clare, Minister for Home Affairs, Press Conference, 30 August 2012, online at:

http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2012/Third%20Quarter/30August2012-PressConferenceSydney.aspx; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120830JasonClarePresser.html; 'Search and Rescue Operation in Indonesia', AMSA Media Release, 4pm 31 August 2012; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120831AMSA.pdf; NB - 55 survived the sinking, but one died soon after the rescue; see: 'Survivors arrive on Indonesian shore', Sky News, 31 August 2012, online at: http://www.skynews.com.au/world/article.aspx?id=790045; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20120831SkyNews.html ; for more on this incident see Marg Hutton, 'AUSSAR 2012/5710', sievx.com, online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2012-5710/index.shtml

<sup>41</sup> Michael Bachelard, 'Boat tragedy claims 33 asylum seekers', West Australian, 25 November 2012; copy online at:

http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20121125MichaelBachelard.html; Kate Bastians, 'Lone survivor "floated for three days", *West Australian*, 16 November 2012; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20121116KateBastians.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/20121116KateBastians.html</a>; see also: 'Asylum boat sunk en-route to Christmas Island', Hazara Asylum Seekers website,14 November 2012, online at: <a href="http://hazaraasylumseekers.wordpress.com/2012/11/14/asylum-boat-sunk-en-route-to-christmas-island/">http://hazaraasylumseekers.wordpress.com/2012/11/14/asylum-boat-sunk-en-route-to-christmas-island/</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/26October2012/20121114Hazara.html">http://sievx.com/articles/LostBoats/26October2012/20121114Hazara.html</a>;

Habibullah, 'My Dark Times: A survivor's story', *New York Times*, 27 April 2013; online at: <a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2013/04/28/world/asia/my-dark-times-a-survivors-story.html">http://www.nytimes.com/2013/04/28/world/asia/my-dark-times-a-survivors-story.html</a>; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130427NewYorkTimes.html

<sup>42</sup> Brendan Nicholson & Harry Edwards, 'Indonesian crewman washes up on Christmas Island', *Australian*, 31 January 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/indonesian-crewman-washes-up-on-christmas-island/story-fn9hm1gu-1226565450979">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/indonesian-crewman-washes-up-on-christmas-island/story-fn9hm1gu-1226565450979</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130131NicholsonEdwards.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130131NicholsonEdwards.html</a>; For SIEV number see Rachel Noble to Marg Hutton, 5 June 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130605RachelNobletoMargHutton.jpg">http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130605RachelNobletoMargHutton.jpg</a>

<sup>43</sup> 'Asylum seekers drown on way to Australia', *Age*, 29 January 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.theage.com.au/opinion/political-news/asylum-seekers-drown-on-way-to-australia-20130129-2djcg.html#ixzz2JW54WRIV">http://www.theage.com.au/opinion/political-news/asylum-seekers-drown-on-way-to-australia-20130129-2djcg.html#ixzz2JW54WRIV</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com/au/13/20130129AAP.html">http://www.theaustralian.com/au/13/20130129AAP.html</a>; Sopy online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/indonesian-crewman-washes-up-on-christmas-island/story-fn9hm1gu-1226565450979">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/indonesian-crewman-washes-up-on-christmas-island/story-fn9hm1gu-1226565450979</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130131NicholsonEdwards.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130131NicholsonEdwards.html</a>

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 9 of 12

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 10 of 12

June' Australian Customs and Border Protection Service, Media Statement, online at: <a href="http://customs.gov.au/site/130610mediarelease\_searchandrescue.asp">http://customs.gov.au/site/130610mediarelease\_searchandrescue.asp</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/20130610CustomsMediaStatement.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/20130610CustomsMediaStatement.html</a>; Figure of estimated 60 passengers comes from Mayday notice — see

"Pan-Pan" and "Mayday Relay" notices extracted from AUSSAR 2013/3821',copy online at:

<sup>44 &#</sup>x27;Two dead as asylum boat capsizes north of Christmas Island', Australian, 25 March 2013; online at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/nation/two-dead-as-asylumboat-capsizes-report/story-e6frg6nf-1226605476576; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130325Australian.html; Search and rescue incident off Christmas Island - final update - 27 March 2013', Australian Customs and Border Protection Media Release, 27 March 2013, online at: http://www.customs.gov.au/site/130327mediarelease SARupdate.asp; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130327CustomsandBPCMediaRelease.html; Brendan Nicholson & Paige Taylor, 'High seas error turns elation to agony', Australian, 26 March 2013, online at; http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/high-seas-error-turns-elation-to-agony/story-fn9hm1gu-1226605871428; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130326NicholsonTaylor.html For SIEV number see Rachel Noble to Marg Hutton, 5 June 2013, online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130605RachelNobletoMargHutton.jpg 'Assessment of search and rescue incident off Christmas Island;, Australian Customs and Border Protection Media Release, 17 April 2013, online at: http://www.customs.gov.au/site/130417mediarelease-assessment-of-SAR-incident-off-Cl.asp; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130417CustomsandBPCMediaRelease.html <sup>45</sup> Michael Bachelard & Bianca Hall, 'Asylum-seeker boat sinks, killing five', Age, 13 April 2013; online at: http://www.theage.com.au/opinion/political-news/asylumseekerboat-sinks-killing-five-20130412-2hr30.html; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130413BachelardHall.html; Patrick Lion, 'More asylum-seeker boats have been intercepted in Australian waters after other refugee vessels capsize', Herald Sun, 15 April 2013; online at: http://www.heraldsun.com.au/news/national/more-asylum-seeker-boats-have-been-intercepted-in-australian-waters-after-other-refugee-vessels-capsize/story-fncynkc6-1226620229227; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130415PatrickLion.html; Tony Kevin, 'Did Australian authorities do enough to try to save asylum seeker lives?', Eureka Street, 15 April 2013; online at: http://www.eurekastreet.com.au/article.aspx?aeid=35837; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130415TonyKevin.html; Kate Bastians, 'Shipwrecked Afghan prayed for rescue', West Australian, 17 April 2013; online at: http://au.news.yahoo.com/thewest/a/-/wa/16765887/shipwrecked-afghan-prayed-for-rescue/; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130417KateBastians.html; Rachel Baxendale and Nicolas Perpitch, 'Man feared drowned had fled Taliban attacks', Australian, 23 April 2013; online at: http://www.theaustralian.com.au/nationalaffairs/immigration/man-feared-drowned-had-fled-taliban-attacks/story-fn9hm1gu-1226626378792; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130423BaxendalePerpitch.html; This boat is known by the AMSA incident reference number AUSSAR 2013/2487. 46 Michael Bachelard 'Two more asylum seekers die trying to reach Australia', SMH, 17 May 2013, online at: http://www.smh.com.au/world/two-more-asylum-seekers-dietrying-to-reach-australia-20130517-2jpzb.html#ixzz2TV846CVt; copy online at: http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130517Bachelard.html <sup>47</sup> In late May 2013, the ABC reported that 28 lifejackets had washed up on the shores of Cocos Island and that one was 'believed to have contained a small amount of Iranian money' and that the 'Australian Maritime Safety Authority cannot find a specific [Safety of Life at Sea] incident it can relate to the life jackets.' See 'Fears for asylum seekers after life jackets wash up on Cocos Island beach', ABC, 27 May 2013, online at: http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-05-27/fears-more-asylum-seekers-may-havedrowned/4714346; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/28LifeJackets/20130527ABC.html; I had not included this incident in this table until the update of 2 February 2014, because I didn't believe that it met the threshold criteria of a probable drowning incident. My opinion changed after I read an account in Crikey, from Lauren Smith a former admin officer for the Department of Immigration. Smith wrote: [T]he day I returned from Christmas Island I was told 28 life jackets had washed up on the shores of Cocos Island, an Australian island. Some 28 Iranian refugees had been killed in Australian waters. I was devastated to learn this, but I begun to put together the pieces of the puzzle. For a week while I was on Christmas Island, I had been waiting for that boat to arrive on shore, so we could assess their claims for asylum...We knew for a week they were close to our shores [and] we were constantly monitoring them.' See Lauren Smith, 'Ex-Immigration officer: is there asylum seeker blood on my hands?', Crikey, 30 January 2014, online at: http://www.crikey.com.au/2014/01/30/ex-immigration-officer-is-there-asylum-seeker-blood-on-my-hands/?wpmp\_switcher=mobile&wpmp\_tp=1; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/28LifeJackets/20140130Smith.html; The fact that the Department of Immigration & Citizenship (DIAC) had been expecting a boat at Christmas Island around this time that fitted with the lifeboats washing up persuaded me that this incident should be included in this table. <sup>48</sup> See 'Jason Clare Press Conference with Rear Admiral David Johnston RAN', 9 June 2013, online at: http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Transcripts/Pages/2013/Second%20Quarter/9-June-2013-PressConferencewithRearAdmiralDavidJohnstonRAN.aspx: copy online at; http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/20130609JasonClare.html : 'Search and rescue operation west of Christmas Island Final update - 1530 AEST 10

http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/20130608PanPanandMayDay.html ; 'Asylum Seeker Search: no survivors from sunken asylum boat near Christmas Island' AM, 10 June 2013, online at: http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-06-09/christmas-island-asylum-seeker-search-no-survivors-found/4742776 ; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/20130610AM.html ; for more on this incident see: Marg Hutton, 'AUSSAR 2013/3821', sievx.com, online at http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-3821/index.shtml

<sup>49</sup> 'A vessel was sighted heading towards Cocos Island, but could not be relocated despite an extensive search effort. The incident occurred in June 2013, approximately 260 nautical miles north-west of Cocos Island. It is estimated that at least 34 people are deceased.' Don Smith, National Manager, Counter People Smuggling Taskforce, Australian Customs and Border Protection Service, Letter to Marg Hutton, copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/201307xxDonSmithtoMargHutton.pdf;

See also Miranda Devine, 'Another boat missing after answering Labor's siren call', Daily Telegraph Blog, 13 June 2013, online at:

http://blogs.news.com.au/dailytelegraph/mirandadevine/index.php/dailytelegraph/comments/another\_boat\_missing\_after\_answering\_labors\_siren\_call; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130613MirandaDevine.html">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130613MirandaDevine.html</a>; Mal Larsen to Marg Hutton, 18 June 2013, copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/20130618MalLarsentoMargHutton.html and AMSA Incident Details Report for AUSSAR 2013/3877, obtained under FOI; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/Jayawe/20130809AMSAFOIJayawe.pdf

<sup>50</sup> 'One person was reported as being swept overboard during a voyage to Australia in June 2013', Don Smith to Marg Hutton, op.cit. online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/201307xxDonSmithtoMargHutton.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2013/201307xxDonSmithtoMargHutton.pdf</a> . It is presumed that this drowning occurred on SIEV 749 on 16 June 2013 as it is the only boat that arrived in June that had a single fatality listed by DIAC. See DIAC FOI FA 13/05/01082 copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/FOI/DIAC/20130806-FA1305IMABoatsSince2011.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/FOI/DIAC/20130806-FA1305IMABoatsSince2011.pdf</a>

For Papua New Guinea arrangement see Transcript of Joint Press Conference of the Prime Minister, Prime Minister of Papua New Guinea, Minister for Immigration and Attorney-General, held in Brisbane on 19 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2">http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2">http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2">http://www.pm.gov.au/press-office/transcript-joint-press-conference-2</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013----5">http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013----5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5">http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5">http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/Mediareleases/Pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov.au/mediareleases/pages/2013/Third%20Quarter/21-July-2013---5</a><a href="http://www.ministerhomeaffairs.gov

<sup>52</sup> 'Last night our officers have rescued 88 people, and they've recovered the body of a little baby boy. The... initial advice to me is that there were 97 people on board, and a search and rescue effort is happening right now. That search and rescue is happening 87 nautical miles north of Christmas Island.', Jason Clare, Minister for Home Affairs, Press Conference, 13 July 2013, transcript online at: <a href="http://www.jasonclare.com.au/media/transcripts/1671-press-conference-sydney.html">http://www.jasonclare.com.au/media/transcripts/1671-press-conference-sydney.html</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4724/20130713JasonClarePresser.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4724/20130713JasonClarePresser.html</a>

'A baby boy died and 88 people were plucked to safety after the vessel capsized some 87 nautical miles north of the Australian territory of Christmas Island on Friday morning. Rescuers, alerted by a distress call, were only able to reach the scene late that evening and a short time later a huge wave broke over the boat and it began to sink. The Australian Maritime Safety Authority (AMSA) said the search and rescue operation was called off after dark on Saturday."This decision was made based on the high probability that anyone alive would have been found during the day and on medical advice on survivability," AMSA said in a statement on Sunday.' Sam Maiden & Kieran Campbell, 'Search called off in asylum boat tragedy', News Ltd Network, 14 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/search-called-off-in-asylum-boat-tragedy/story-e6frg6n6-1226678841239">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/search-called-off-in-asylum-boat-tragedy/story-e6frg6n6-1226678841239</a>; copy online at <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4724/20130714MaidenCampbell.html">http://sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4724/20130714MaidenCampbell.html</a>

The Australian Customs and Border Protection Service can confirm that the total number of people rescued from the capsized vessel on Tuesday, 16 July 2013, is 146 survivors. Tragically there are also four deceased. Information obtained from the crew of the vessel suggests there were approximately 150 people on board the vessel.' Australian Customs and Border Protection Service, Media Release, 22 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.customs.gov.au/site/130722mediarelease\_capsize\_update.asp">http://www.customs.gov.au/site/130722mediarelease\_capsize\_update.asp</a>. It should be noted, however, that two apparently well-informed newspaper reports (as yet unconfirmed by official government sources) claim that as well as the four people who lost their lives on this boat, there are another eleven people who are missing presumed drowned. See Gemma Jones, 'A two-year-old asylum seeker lost her mother and sister when a boat carrying more than 150 capsized', News Ltd Network, 17 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.news.com.au/national-news/a-twoyearold-asylum-seeker-lost-her-mother-and-sister-when-a-boat-carrying-more-than-150-capsized/story-fncynjr2-1226681023315#ixzz2ZL136tZr ; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4816/20130717Jones3.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4816/20130717Jones3.html</a>; and Paige Taylor, 'Baby's revival a beacon in a sea of misery', *Australian*,22 July 2013, online

http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4816/20130717Jones3.html; and Paige Taylor, 'Baby's revival a beacon in a sea of misery', *Australian*,22 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/babys-revival-a-beacon-in-a-sea-of-misery/story-fn9hm1gu-1226682839225">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/immigration/babys-revival-a-beacon-in-a-sea-of-misery/story-fn9hm1gu-1226682839225</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4816/20130722Taylor.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-4816/20130722Taylor.html</a>

<sup>54</sup> '189 survivors have been found and 20 bodies have been recovered' - George Roberts, 'Death toll from Java asylum seeker boat tragedy rises as police hunt smuggler', ABC, 30 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-07-30/death-toll-from-java-boat-tragedy-rises/4854150">http://sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130730Roberts.html</a>; see also: Yuliasri Perdani, Jakarta Post, 26 July 2013, online at: at:

© Marg Hutton 2011-2014 Page 11 of 12

http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2013/07/26/police-name-four-suspects-over-cianjur-boat-sinking.htm; copy online at:

http://www.sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130726Perdani.html; George Roberts, 'Death toll from asylum boat sinking rises...', ABC, 26 July 2013, online at: http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-07-26/indonesia-asylum-seeker-boat-sinking-death-toll-video/4844808; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130726Roberts.html; Adi Marsiela, '189 survive boat sinking, Indonesia looks for lost', newsobserver.com, 24 July 2013, online at: http://www.newsobserver.com/2013/07/24/3052692/asylum-seeker-boat-sinks-off-indonesia.html#storylink=cpy; copy online at:

http://sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130724Marsiela.html and Paul Toohey, 'Asylum-seeker boat bound for Christmas Island sinks after leaving Java, 18 still missing, feared dead', *Daily Telegraph*, 24 July 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/asylum-seeker-boat-bound-for-christmas-island-sinks-after-leaving-java-one-dead/story-e6frg6n6-1226684064434">http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/asylum-seeker-boat-bound-for-christmas-island-sinks-after-leaving-java-one-dead/story-e6frg6n6-1226684064434</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130724Toohey.html">http://sievx.com/articles/BASARNAS2013July/20130724Toohey.html</a>

Note: numbers on board this vessel and total lives lost in the sinking incident may be subject to change; this table will be updated with more precise information when it becomes available.

<sup>55</sup> 'Australian authorities have suspended search and rescue operations for survivors from a foundered vessel 120nm north of Christmas Island after rescuing 106 people. The suspension follows confirmation from on scene crews and interviews with survivors that all survivors have been recovered... Information received from survivors indicates that up to five people remain unaccounted for. After an extensive search of the area for further survivors or bodies, none have been sighted, it is therefore believed any people unaccounted for have gone down with part of the vessel.', 'Border Protection Command assists vessel - Final Update: 18.38 AEST', Joint ACBPS and AMSA media release, 20 August 2013, online at:

http://customs.gov.au/site/BorderProtectionCommandassistsvesselFinalUpdate.asp; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/AUSSAR2013-5584/20130820ACBPSandAMSAFinalUpdate.html

For details of Operation Sovereign Borders see 'The Coalition's Operation Sovereign Borders Policy', July 2013, online at: <a href="http://tinyurl.com/kzb39vs">http://tinyurl.com/kzb39vs</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://tinyurl.com/kzb39vs">http://tinyurl.c

This is the first asylum boat sinking since the introduction of the government's tough new border protection policy – Operation Sovereign Borders (OSB). Information on asylum seekers is now very tightly controlled and relevant departments are forbidden from commenting. The only official statements concerning this sinking that have been made to date can be found in the media release issued the evening following the sinking and the OSB Weekly briefings of 30 September & 4 October. See 'Tragic Boat Incident in Indonesia', OSB Media Release, 28 September 2013, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/20130928Morrison.html">http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/20130928Morrison.html</a>; 'Press Conference Transcript', OSB, 30 September 2013, copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130930OSBPresser2.html">http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20131004OSBPresser3.html</a>; I have also compiled an archive of media articles concerning this sinking which is available online here: 'Agrabinta', <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/index.shtml">http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/index.shtml</a>

There have been conflicting reports regarding the total number of bodies recovered from the Agrabinta sinking – some say 42, and others say 43. The most recent report I've seen from Lebanon (where the survivors were returned) states '43' which is the figure I have gone with. This will be updated when and if further information comes to light. See 'Lebanese boat survivors return home', *Daily Star*, online at: <a href="http://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2013/Oct-06/233700-lebanese-boat-survivors-return-home.ashx">http://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2013/Oct-06/233700-lebanese-boat-survivors-return-home.ashx</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/20131006DailyStar2.html">http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20130927Sinking/20131006DailyStar2.html</a>

<sup>59</sup> 'At approximately 11.30 AEDST on December 9, 30 people had been rescued from a sunken vessel at Cibalong Garut, in Indonesian waters, approximately 75nm west of Cilacap, West Java... There have been reports of three deceased persons, however this has not yet been confirmed through our post. Our post has advised of two deaths and several persons being in a critical condition.', Scott Morrison, Minister for Immigration and Border Protection, 'Incident in Indonesia', Statement to the House of Representatives, Canberra, 10 December 2013, online at: <a href="http://www.minister.immi.gov.au/media/sm/2013/sm210187.htm">http://www.minister.immi.gov.au/media/sm/2013/sm210187.htm</a>; copy online at: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20131210Morrison.html">http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20131210Morrison.html</a>; see also 'Three asylum seekers die in boat sinking off Indonesia', *Jakarta Globe*, 10 December 2013, online at:

http://www.thejakartaglobe.com/news/three-asylum-seekers-die-in-boat-sinking-off-indonesia/; copy online at: http://sievx.com/articles/OSB/20131210JakartaGlobe.html

Page 12 of 12

# **APPENDIX**

# Howard government claims that three asylum seeker boats went missing in March 2000 with all on board presumed drowned are unsubstantiated

There are eight reasons why the count of asylum seeker deaths at sea should not include the 360-380 presumed deaths on three boats that allegedly went missing in March 2000:

# 1. According to a 2013 letter from the Department of Immigration and Citizenship no evidence of the existence of these 3 vessels can be found

In May 2013 I wrote to the Minister and asked:

In the interests of clarity, transparency and public accountability I would be very grateful if you could check DIAC's records to determine if there is any reliable independently sourced evidentiary basis to the claims made by the Howard government that three asylum seeker vessels disappeared without trace in March-April 2000. Has the Department received many (or any) requests from family members of people who allegedly lost their lives on these missing boats? If there were enquiries did these reach a threshold level where you can confidently assert that on the basis of probability these boats actually existed and disappeared?'

See: http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20130503ToBrendanOConnor

The Acting Assistant Secretary of the Immigration Intelligence Branch replied:

'We have gone through our records and checked with other agencies. Unfortunately we have not been able to find any information on the missing boats mentioned in your correspondence'.

See: http://sievx.com/articles/background/20130725AllanDavistoMargHutton.pdf

# 2. No contemporaneous evidence of 3 missing vessels

In January 2001 (ie 10 months after the 3 boats allegedly went missing) the Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs was questioned on notice about known incidents where people had drowned attempting to enter Australia without authorisation by boat. Significantly, the 3 alleged missing boats were not cited.

See: http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/200103xx-DIMAExtract.html

### 3. Request by the Age in 2001 for access to government files on sinkings denied

Journalist Lindsay Murdoch wrote in an article published in September 2001:

'Files held by Australian officials in Jakarta and Canberra reveal how dozens of attempts to reach Australia's shores have ended in tragedy. But the Howard Government refused a request from The Age for access to the files so the stories could be publicised as a warning to others not to attempt the treacherous voyage.'

See: http://www.sievx.com/articles/psdp/20010906Murdoch.html

# 4. No media interviews with relatives of people on these boats either at the time or since

This is in sharp contrast to substantiated reports of missing boats in which media articles include photos of victims and interviews with their relatives and friends.

 $See \ for \ example: \ \underline{http://sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2011/20110508NatalieOBrienSunHeraldExtra.pdf}$ 

### 5. Scepticism of the middle-eastern origin asylum-seeker community

Members of the middle-eastern community at the time the three boats allegedly went missing did not believe the reports as no one in the community was reporting missing relatives or friends. See Ghassan Nakhoul, *Overboard*, Dar Meera, 2011, pp.119-21

Marg Hutton 2011-2013 Appendix page 1 of 2

## 6. Statistically anomalous

If three boats had gone missing in the year 2000 with 360 people drowned then the asylum seeker death rate for that year would be 11 per cent - more than four times higher than the average substantiated death rate and double the rate of the worst substantiated year on record (2001 where the sinking of SIEVX accounted for a 5 per cent death rate)

See Mortality table: <a href="http://sievx.com/articles/background/Mortality.pdf">http://sievx.com/articles/background/Mortality.pdf</a>

7. Minister declared other boats missing and was proven wrong when they later arrived safely In December 2000, nine months after the three boats allegedly went missing, the Minister for Immigration declared another two boats to be missing with all presumed drowned which later arrived at Ashmore Reef safely with no lives lost. When these two boats turned up the Minister for Immigration conceded he could not confirm his earlier assertions that three boats allegedly went missing in March. See: <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20001218MinistersReportsPremature.html">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/20001218MinistersReportsPremature.html</a> and <a href="http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf">http://www.sievx.com/articles/background/QoN-3241-20010206.pdf</a>

# 8. Not referenced by the Expert Panel on Asylum Seekers

The 'Report of the Expert Panel on Asylum Seekers', 2012 included a table of the 'Number of Deaths and Missing Persons at Sea from October 2001 to June 2012'. This table included reference to two boats from 2009 and 2010 as missing with all on board presumed drowned. If there had been substantive evidence of the loss of 3 boats in the year 2000 then it is reasonable to expect that the Expert Panel would have included this in their table.

See (p.75): http://www.sievx.com/articles/miscellaneous/2012/expert\_panel\_on\_asylum\_seekers\_full\_report.pdf

Marg Hutton 2011-2013 Appendix page 2 of 2